

**I n t e r n a t i o n a l C e n t e r o f C o n f l i c t a n d
N e g o t i a t i o n**

I C C N

Nana Berekashvili,
George Nizharadze,
Nina Tsihistavi,

Gender Dimension in the Wine Sector in Georgia



Niko Pirosmani, 'Vintage, 1870'

Tbilisi, 2008

Table of context:

Introduction	3
1. Gender Equality Overview in Georgia;	4
a) Gender Approach;	
b) History;	
c) Women's NGO Output;	
d) Gender Equality Institutional Machinery Today;	
e) Gender Approach in Economic Development of Georgia;	
f) Some Gender Perspectives in Wine Industry in Georgia;	
2. The Study on Gender Equality in the Wine Sector in Georgia	10
a) Historical overview and general gender trends;	
b) Gender analysis of the situation in wine enterprises	12
• Methodology	
• Criteria for gender analysis	
• Analyzing gender equality by topics	
• Conclusions	17
3. Gender Dimension in GTZ Activities in Wine Sector	18
4. Recommendations	20

Introduction

The following report presents the results of the study of Gender Dimension in the Wine Sector in Georgia. The study was conducted as a supplementary to the GTZ project: Promoting Private Sector Development in Georgia on the base of agreement with GTZ by the team of experts in the field of Gender Studies and Social Studies of the International Center of Conflict and Negotiation.

The goal of the study was to examine the situation in the wine sector in Georgia concerning gender equality problem. The special emphasis was made on gender picture in the wine factories of Kakheti Region.

The first chapter presents an overview of Gender Equality situation in Georgia and the role and efficiency of National Institutional Machinery. The second chapter offers the overview of the gender equity situation in wine sector in Georgia, based on the small scale qualitative study surveying the experts of this field.

The study served to answering the following questions that were formulated as: identification of representation of women and men, their roles, status and incomes in every parts of the wine production chain – vineyards, harvesting, producing of wine, market: Identification of the trends and attitudes through past decades and perspectives for more gender equitable approaches in the wine business; And finally, elaboration of recommendations for further gender equality and empowerment of women in the wine sector.

And finally, the task of special interest was to trace the impacts of GTZ project activities on the gender equality in wine sector.

As the whole process study took place during February, when main winemaking activities are suspended, we can not directly observe specific features of gender equality/ inequality during active phase of wine production or harvesting. And although, the information obtained is more indirect and speculative in nature, we hope, that it reflects actual gender related trends and attitudes in the sphere.

Nana Berekashvili, Head of the Gender Division, ICCN
George Nizharadze, Head of the Research Division, ICCN
Nina Tsihistavi, Chair, Caucasus Women's Network, CWN
Rusudan Gotsiridze, member of the Gender Division, as an interviewer

1. Gender Equality Overview in Georgia:

Gender Approach

Each country, first of all, shall be a guarantor for exercising of his/her rights by each member of the society within its territory.

Equality of women and men depends on those in-depth changes, which should be implemented at all levels of the society, starting from local government and to the highest governmental structure.

Georgian society and government recognize significance of gender equality, as a necessary condition for sustainable development and overall realization of human potential. In this respect, special attention should be paid to status of women, particularly in those spheres, where there still persist implicit barriers and problems, are these legislative intentions or women's equal participation in social, economic and political life of the country. It is significant that in Georgia, there were two parallel structures, operating in this sphere to achieve gender equality.

When we speak about gender equality, based on the Constitution of Georgia, we know that in Georgia equal rights, freedom and opportunities are ensured for men and women. It means that women and men have equal opportunities to make their contributions to national, political, economic, social and cultural development of the country and take equal advantages of the achievements.

History

Political obligation of Georgia (within the framework of Beijing Action Platform, 1999) involves strengthening of national institutional mechanisms and development of collaboration of the higher circles of government with them, to ensure fulfillment of the set objectives and obligations.

As a basis for gender equality policy in Georgia there are regarded generally recognized international norms provided for in number of conventions and declarations, to which Georgia is a party and compliance with which is an obligation of GoG¹. These are:

Universal Declaration of Human Rights, Convention of Women's Rights, Convention on Elimination of Women's Discrimination; Beijing Action Platform etc.

National institutional mechanisms have their own history in Georgia:

In 1999 - by the Decree of the President of Georgia, there was established the State Commission for Elaboration of the State Program for Women Development²;

¹ GoG – Government of Georgia

² On 20th February 1999, by the Decree No 48 of the President of Georgia, to develop policies for improvement of women's condition, there was established State Commission. Ms. Rusudan Beridze, Deputy Secretary of the State Security Council in the sphere of protection of human rights, was appointed

2004 – Governmental Ad Hoc Working Group for establishment of the State Commission on Gender Equality³;

2004 – Advisory Board for Gender Equality under Chairman of the Parliament;

2005 – Resolution of Georgian Government (Resolution No 109, of 28th June 2005, Tbilisi) on establishment of State Commission for Gender Equality Issues⁴;

2005 – On the basis of the Charter of State Commission for Gender Equality Issues (Article 3, Section 2), there was established State Advisory Board for Gender Equality;

For identification of gender problems, national institutional mechanisms plan to review national legislation, also review of all major directions of the state programs and state policies to ensure equality of women and men.

For ensuring equal participation of men and women in all spheres of life, national institutional mechanisms play significant role in creation of state accountability and fulfillment of obligations.

1998 – 2000 – State Action Plan “For Improvement of Women’s Status”⁵;

2001 – 2004 – Revised State Action Plan “For Improvement of Women’s Status”⁶;

2000 – 2004 – State Action Plan against Women Violence”⁷

2003 – 2005 – State Action Plan against Trafficking⁸;

2004 – 2009 – Millennium Development Goals (MDG) – Governmental Program⁹;

2005 – 2006 – Action Plan against Human Traffic¹⁰;

2005 – 2015 – Strategic document – Economic Development and Poverty Reduction Program (EDPRP);

Women’s NGO Output

In Georgia Gender Equality issue accounts already its history. Started from the late 90s a few NGOs were created to address women’s issues and discuss forms of discrimination. It was

as a Chairman of the Commission.

³ After the “Rose Revolution”, in 2003, the Group of Institutional Mechanisms of Women’s nongovernmental Coalition, on 14th February, 2004, submitted to the President and Prime Minister the incentive package, to establish an effective institutional mechanism for ensuring gender equality in Georgia. To support local incentive, the GoG gave its response to the incentive and in August 2004, there was established ad hoc working group, under the State Minister. Ms. Tamar Beruchashvili, the Deputy State Minister, for the issues of European Integration, was a Head of this Group

⁴ Ms Tamar Beruchashvili, Deputy State Minister in the sphere of Euro-Atlantic Integration was appointed as a Chairman of the Governmental Commission.

⁵ Decree of the President of Georgia No 308, of 18.06.1998

⁶ Decree of the President of Georgia No 511, of 28.08.1999

⁷ Decree of the President of Georgia No 64, of 25.02.2000

⁸ Decree of the President of Georgia No 105, of 17.01.2003

⁹ Among 8 Goals of Millennium Development, Goal 3 serves to improvement of the gender balance and increase the power of women.

¹⁰ Decree of the President of Georgia No 623, of 29.12.2004

started loud discussions on tabooed issues of women's equal participation in decision making level.

Since that time many things were changed: for today women's NGOs became a strong opponent in arguing and/or motivating actors in the field about what should be done in the field. Still they are facing lack of capacity to fight in united format for achieving more effectiveness. Despite having number of coalitions, networks, that are uniting number of NGOs and leader women, women's needs are not heard as enough strong voice to take into consideration and the society is keeping silence about issues of gender blind policy of the government, prostitution, domestic violence, etc. On the one hand, it is a result of having not very effective tools and methodology how to improve, how to motivate, how to fulfill. On the other hand, of course it is result of not very sustainable policy of local and international organisations programmes that are in many cases duplicating work in the region due to lack of clear information. Common strategy for further actions still is to be elaborated. The issue is too much deep and long.

The item of 2003 'Rose Revolution' and its reflection on Gender Equality:

'We need More Women and more professionals in Politics' – Saakashvili started his 'presidential way' with this formulation and approach (citation, January 2004).

Yes, women are often using new political formations for their needs – to achieve results; so the same was done in Georgia also. In January 2004 we have submitted to the President and Prime Minister our package about new, proper, effective, important steps on 'New Institutional Machinery on Gender Equality in Georgia'. Yes we did it because of having knowledge, lessons learned, and huge motivation to apply in reality, to set something that is responding.

Women's organisations lobby process to create proper institutional machinery on gender equality won: State Commission on Gender Equality for Gender Equality was established by the legal act issued by Prime Minister Nogaideli (for 1 year 2005-2006) and its mandate was to: draft State Policy on Gender Equality and draft National Action Plan on Gender Equality. Also it was established another machinery under the Parliament of Georgia – Gender Equality Parliamentary Consultation Council (with patronage of UNDP South Caucasus¹¹ Programme 'Gender and Politics').

Gender Equality Institutional Machinery Today

For today the State Commission on Gender Equality is abolished. The topic of Gender Equality in Executive Power was included to the portfolio of State Minister¹² on Reforms in Georgia. Recently the office of State Minister on Reforms in Georgia was also abolished and the issue of Gender Equality within the Executive Power is still virtual.

So that we have just only one part of Institutional Machinery on Gender equality in Georgia which is just a consultative structure under the Parliament, is not influential and its existence is hardly known in the Parliament itself.

Gender Equality Advisory Board, Under the Chairman of the Parliament of Georgia, on one side and Governmental Commission for Gender Equality Issues on the other, will continue joint

¹¹ The Programme is running in Armenia and Georgia.

¹² State Minister on Reforms in Georgia is Mr. Kakha Bendukidze.

attempts, to reveal and solve the problems, in those significant spheres, which are regarded as a basis for development of the society.

The State Policy on Gender Equality was adopted by the Parliament of Georgia (May 2006). Implementation of the State Policy would contribute to development of specific programs, for building of truly democratic state, where the citizens' rights would be ensured by the possibility of their execution.

National Action Plan was reviewed by the Government (September 2006). During last 3 years, Commission for Gender Equality Issues has developed major priorities of gender policy of the country and the document on the implementation instruments, which are provided in this work. The National Action Plan is not adopted. (Mostly possible it is put somewhere on the shelter). The government stated during their meeting that they will take the information (through reviewing the NAP) for consideration! Draft Action Plan for Ensuring Gender Equality for 2006 - 2011¹³ is one of new instruments of the state mechanism, development and implementation of which was undertaken by the Government.

Current policies of Georgian Government strive for gender equality, elimination of discrimination, improvement of social conditions, realization of women's and men's opportunities in the social and political life.

There are various mechanisms for exercising of human rights and obligations at national, regional and international levels. In some cases these mechanisms are provided for by constitution and national legislation and in some cases – with international documents dealing with human rights. Mechanisms, provided for by constitution and national legislation ensure more specific and effective measures, and generally, these are the measures, which should be tested and put in order, first of all.

National legislative system may be oriented to execution of human rights. To make effective adjustments to the legislation, with regard of the issues of execution of women's rights, it is necessary to gain thorough understanding of existing mechanisms and tools provided by them.

Creation and operation of the national institutional mechanism for gender equality, or equality of women and men, strengthens the capacity of state to support GoG to identify and eliminate gender problems, existing in the country and in the legislation.

Systematic identification of gender problems would contribute to development of the strategy, which would reveal, assess and evaluate the aspects of equal participation of men and women in socio-economic and political life.

Gender Approach in Economic Development of Georgia

One of the major priorities of Gender-oriented state policy is ensuring availability of equal opportunities for women and men in the sphere of economics. Gender-oriented economic policy is of great significance for promotion of economic development of the country and fostering of

¹³ For the first time in Georgia, the State Action Plan was prepared from the bottom to top, in 2004-2005, through joint efforts of NGOs, experts in the field, representatives of the governmental structures. Support to preparation of Gender Equality Action Plan was provided by OSCE/ODIHR and it was passed to the Governmental for submission at the Government Session Commission

social justice. It is an actual, effective mechanism for implementation of poverty reduction strategy.

Fostering of the principles of market economy had a great impact on socio-economic status of women and men. Structure of labor market was changed and gender segregation became even deeper. Women have less opportunity to be involved in those spheres of economy, where there are greater chances to increase one's incomes. They still work in less subsidized spheres. The processes of restructuring and privatization in the country have left great part of the labor forces without job, without any social guarantees. It caused further aggravation of the situation with the poverty. Number of unemployed women, in 2004, compared with 2002, was increased by 4.5% and in the same period, number of unemployed men decreased by 7.9%. Share of people, beyond the poverty line decreased slightly and amounted to 52%, over 16% of population are in extreme poverty and majority of them are women. Demographic pattern grew even worse, rates of labor migration and various types of violence (economic, environmental, psychological, physical etc.) against women, in the society and family increased.

Because of limited investment resources and inadequate technologies there was not formed effective environment for entrepreneurship, which would contribute to increase of business activities of the population, though there are no legal barriers to women's entrepreneurship.

In the structures, regulating economic policies, number of women is too small; they take minor part in economic decision-making. Traditional gender roles cause inequality of the statuses of men and women¹⁴.

Compared with the men, they have limited opportunities with respect of professional development and carrier growth.

Existing social mechanisms (free kindergartens, assistance to the pregnant women, family assistance etc.) are not able to ensure development of enabling environment in this respect. Conditions of safety and labor protection for women are worse. In the economic policy of the state there are not regarded gender parameters, in this respect, state economic policy is gender neutral. Gender aspects are not reflected in the main directions of budget policy. Up to present institutions, which developed budget policies, had not set such objectives. Control of distribution and usage of financial resources existing in the country lacks transparency, with respect of gender, what hinders determination of target orientation and effectiveness of the state expenses.

In the country there should exist mechanisms supporting active policies for equal opportunities and employment for men and women. New Labor Code, which is under development, shall ensure actual employment and worthy labor. New Labor Code shall ensure equal working conditions and remuneration, for people of both genders. In addition, special attention should be paid to development of such legal acts in the labor legislation, which would contribute to improvement of competitiveness of working women, at the labor market, to introduction of flexible work schedules and actual execution of all those rights, which stimulate active employment of women in various spheres of economy.

It is very significant to support the incentives of entrepreneurship of women, taking into consideration priority directions of business development, training and re-training of women and men in such professions, which would contribute to actual employment and will be necessarily

¹⁴ Women engagement in business is hindered by traditional actual distribution of the functions in family (e.g. it is obligatory for a woman to be engaged in housekeeping) and in addition, it is also hindered by the deficiency of availability of the professional qualifications, corresponding to the market demand.

motivated from the economic point of view. Equalization of opportunities for men and women requires full set of measures: soft loans, micro financing, improvement of the legal framework for protection of women's labor, expansion of the networks of children's institutions and domestic services, implementation of special programs, for improvement of professional qualifications of the labor forces etc. There should be sought the mechanism, which would ensure improvement of working conditions for all types of employment and specifically, for nonstandard and informal types of employment, opportunities for economic progress and career promotion.

Gender oriented economic policy, inclusion of gender components in the budgeting processes should ensure solving of the most acute socioeconomic problems, what would significantly increase the role and contribution of women in the national economy. By means of gender budget the resources will be distributed in a targeted way, what would contribute to transparency and fairness of budget processes. Gender budget is of great significance, as for the government, also for the civil society. It increases effectiveness of state policies, facilitates progress of the democratic processes, strengthens the responsibility of the government, reduces corruption and all types of discrimination against women, strengthens civil society.

Gender budget increases public incentive, introduction of gender sensitive data contributes to the activities against corruption and discrimination and for those, targeted to satisfaction of the needs of the poorest strata.

Gendered budget increases mutual responsibilities of the society and the government. Formation of the monitoring mechanism for implementation of gender component of the program for economic development and poverty reduction would contribute significantly to transparency and effectiveness of program implementation.

It is significant to pay adequate attention to development of active demographic policies, which is critical for reproduction of the labor forces.

It is necessary to conduct large-scale and complex studies of labor migration, which would provide basis for development of migration policy strategies and special regulatory mechanisms in Georgia. Law "On Migration" would contribute to implementation of the state migration policies, legalization of labor migration and improvement of its socioeconomic effectiveness.

Some Gender perspectives in Wine Industry in Georgia

While speaking about Wine Industry in Georgia we intend to observe partly historical legacy and exclusion and discrimination of women from the field. Historically family employment set the attitude where women depend on a male 'head of family' for employment and housing. Unequal gender division of labor was followed by paternalist production. Traditionally women were considered as a cheap source in family labor market.

Since last decade traditional paternalist production systems changed and somehow modified management and production- distribution chains systems and practices. But paternalist relations from gender perspectives are still in correlation with new employment strategies that in a line with outcomes for women in terms of opportunities may replicate traditional forms of gender inequality in wine industry as the field is considered as an integral part of Georgian tradition and history. So the sphere might be compare with family employment strategies practiced in Georgia.

Last time Wine industry in Georgia touches not only socio economic but political as well discourse which would drive national needs and expectations toward sustainable and effective agricultural policy of Georgia. Agricultural policy with no doubt should be based in Georgian Wine industry Strategic Plan with concrete response to clear goals and objectives.

Rethinking existing practice and historical traditions it is of real importance to touch upon the topic of equitable access and participation in wine sectoral chain, which will promote socially responsible consumption (use) of the produce of the wine.

Equitable participation is a challenge for the sector in terms of identifying special programmes encouraging diversity and non-discrimination while entering the sector. Developing equitable access and participation in Wine Industry for historically disadvantaged groups (women in different roles: wives, sisters, daughters, mothers, etc.) that address possibilities for improving several fields, such as business opportunities, agricultural land access and ownership, infrastructure, finances (gender division of micro and small credits), information, training and re-training skills development.

2 The Study on Gender Equality in the Wine Sector in Georgia

Winemaking in Georgia – Historical overview and general gender trends

In every region of Georgia where the climate allows viticulture wine-making was the important component of traditional family economy, especially in Kakheti region. In the sphere of traditional family wine-making gender roles were regulated quite strictly. Namely, females participated in the auxiliary operations of vineyard treatment and during the vintage (e.g. “The vintage, painting by N. Pirosmiani). In the following units of technological chain not only didn’t females participate but they were forbidden to enter the corresponding venues or even to come close to them¹⁵. It was considered that breaking such a restrictions would influence negatively at the quality of wine (such kind of superstitions were widespread all over the world within the traditionally masculine activity spheres, such as hunting, sailing etc.). Thus in Georgia by tradition the wine-making was considered to be pure masculine activities and the influence that social representation is felt in present times too. At the same time the current gender situation in Georgian wine-making industry is also influenced by some traditions formed during the Soviet period and shortly described below.

Wine-making industry in Georgia was conceived in the second half of 19th century, but only during the Soviet times it begins to play important role in the economy of the country. In the frames of current topic the most interesting period is 60-80s of 20th century, when, after death of Stalin, so called shady economy becomes widespread all over USSR including Georgia. Briefly the shady economy could be characterized as follows: state plans, having the status of the law, were fulfilled or even exceeded, but it happened due to the gross violations technology norms,

¹⁵ Source of information: Teimuraz Glonti, Winemaker, historian, Chef editor of the magazine “The Cane and the Wine”;

tampering the produce, manipulating with digits, which provided the shady elite with grand illegal incomes.

From the gender viewpoint the shady economy was dominated by males. In corrupt party or state structures females could be found here and there, but so called directors' corps (i.e. industrial elite) consisted practically only of men. Females' positions as a rule were limited by the middle units, mainly in the financial ones. Consequently, their incomes were much less than those of the elite.

In the system of Georgian shady economy wine-making played one of the most important roles. Identifying someone as a 'wine-maker' implied ranking the person among the shady economy elite and practically meant 'a very rich guy'. The money was made by tampering production, decreasing of the share of alcohol and other machination.

High-quality wine was produced in a little quantity and was mainly attributed for small-volume export, for nomenclature elite, for international forums and exhibitions. The ordinary consumers could not buy quality wine, and especially it was impossible to buy brand wines (there is special expression to characterize quality wine in Georgia: wine made by wine-makers for their personal usage).

The possibility to earn good income from the wine production sector determined high corruption in the Universities where the relevant specialists were prepared, mainly Georgian Agricultural Institute. The access to wine-production faculty was possible with the solid bribe or with the support of relative - influential winemaker. Our respondents argued that mainly male students studied at the faculty of wine-production. Female students were in minority at the faculty they represented wine-producers families, and after the graduation of the institute and getting diplomas they generally went to the research institutions and in the educational organizations as teachers.

It could be argued that in the wine production sector of the Soviet period it had happened the coincidence of two gender traditions: on the one hand, the dominance of man in the elite of shadow economy, and on the other hand wine-production as business for man. Consequently, female participation in the sector not taking into consideration only few cases, was determined with involvement of women in the low and middle management level of the sector. As in other spheres of shadow economy women were involved in financial departments; also in the middle management level there was one more division Production Control Laboratory. One respondent (Zurab Ramazashvili, steering council chairman of LtD "Telavi Wine Cellar) told that in every successful factory there was experienced head of lab almost always woman, who gave consultancy concerning the quality and could also manipulate with quality of production. The income of head of laboratory was not low in accordance with Soviet standards but it was much more less than the income of Directors and main technologists who usually were men).

The collapse of the Soviet Union was followed by the economic chaos. Big part of wine production sector was also destroyed. Part of the factories continued working with inertia according the old rules, the difference was that the quality control state laboratory did not exist no more and the possibility of wine falsification was much higher. Factory-produced wine was absolutely facilitated. The main part of the wine was exported in the countries of former Soviet union, mainly in Russia. It happened until demand on Georgian wine declined either out of country as in Georgia itself, resulted in the close of many factories in Georgia. Only after that the wine industry oriented on the market was gradually born. Slowly but it was evident that small factories were opened in cooperation with foreign partners in accordance with wine-production international standards. During the research process we had visited these factories (Shumi, Teliani Velly and Telavi Wine Cellar, Mildiani", "Kindzmaraulis Marani", "Tbilvino"). The

representatives of management of these productions told us, that the gender traditions in the wine sector slowly but evidently lose their power. The accent is made on professionalism. It's another question to have or not to have high professional women in the sector, in fact female wine-production specialists are few, because of the situation in the country during the last period. The traditional thinking also influences the professional orientation of women in the mentioned sector. Girl if she does not represent wine makers' family can not think about wine-producers profession. Even today girls on wine production department at the universities are in minority. Instead of all these factors, we had the impression that in the middle and high level of wine-production management the share of involved women is increased and this trend is quite evident during last period.

Gender Analysis of the Situation in Wine Enterprises

Methodology

As noted above, the aim of the study was to examine the situation concerning gender in wine sector with the focus on wine factories.

Methodology of the study was chosen according to the diversified task and shortage of time. Apart from analysis based on overview of the situation in wine sector in general and gender equity in Georgia, specific issues were elaborated by means of interviews conducted with the experts of this field. 10 experts were participated in the survey. 8 of them actively involved in wine production – representatives of top management of successful wine companies, key persons /members of wine makers unions, 2- professors of the department of “winemaking” at the Georgian Agrarian University. These were respondents who expressed their readiness to meet and share. Although there were cases, when respondents refused due to business overload, like Mrs. Manana Potskhverashvili, an authority in the Ministry of Agriculture, Wine and Vineyard's Department.

One of the criteria for selection was representation of women's perspectives and views, so the half of the selected respondents were women.

Here is a list of experts who participated in a study as a respondent:

Levan Davitashvili - “Mildiany”, executive director, member of the board of “The Wine Makers' Union”

Dimitri Lebanidze - “Kindzmaraulis Marani, deputy Director

Gaga Margvelashvili - “Tbilgvino” president

Nana Macharauli - “Teliani Valley”, Office Manager

Nana Gamakharidze - “Shumi” Company, Tsinandali, Finance Manager

Tamar Begiashvili - “Shumi” Company, Tsinandali, Office Manager

Shalva Shatirishvili - Full Professor, Speciality - Winemaking

Shorena Gigolashvili - Associated Professor at the State Agrarian University foodstuffs technology departments, winemaking.

Anna Godabrelidze - Wine Department; Chairman of Degustation Committee and the President of the Union of the Winemakers

Zurab Ramazashvili - Joint-Stock Company “Telavi Wine Cellar”, Kudgelaauri, Chairman of The board.

Some additional information was received by means of several telephone conversations with the experts in history of wine in Georgia.¹⁶

Criteria for Gender Analysis

Gender analysis examines on systematic base, what different impact does or could a policy and practices, program or activity have on men's and women's lives, their wellbeing and development separately or in relation to each other. Essential is to analyze power relations, recourses, activities, values and norms, rights, facilitating and constraining forces. Gender analysis requires quantitative and qualitative information which could be gathered by different means and based on variety of methodological approaches.

Following Gender and Development and Women's Empowerment approaches for policy and planning and monitoring and evaluation we focused our attention on two methodological models: Gender Policies Analysis in Social relations approach by Naila Kabeer, UN expert and professor at Sussex University; Women's Empowerment Framework, elaborated by Un consultant Sara Longve.

There are criteria for evaluating policy which institution, program or project has applied, no matter intentionally or not, referring to gender equality. According to this approach several levels of gender policy are identified: Gender Blind, Gender Neutral, Gender Aware, Gender Specific and ending with Gender Transformational/redistributive.

We applied this analytical tool to the picture derived from situational analysis from several wine factories in Kakheti.

Our estimation of the sector as a whole and wine companies specifically proves that **Gender Blind Approach** is the most appropriate definition to the Georgian reality in the field. The typical position for the gender blind approach is well reflected in a phrase: "*We treat everyone alike in this organization*", but there is **no identification of differing needs, priorities or interests** of women and men – human resources management practices and policies are designed for workers who are seen as a homogeneous group of people. There are **no dis-aggregation of statistics** (gender sensitive) – who holds the top posts, who has most access to training; **No gender diagnosis of work issues** – health and safety, career development, absenteeism.

To our estimation:

- There were never been undertaken works to identify different gender needs, priorities and interests referring to wine production chain or consumption neither in whole sector, non on factory levels
- On the state level no statistics by gender were available to describe decision making positions occupied by men and women.
- In the wine enterprises, according to expert's answers, there is no clear picture of the ratio of men-women workers and what roles and jobs do men and women perform during the active phase of planting, caring and harvesting.
- We could not find any description or classification of the jobs on the bases of damage to health. There was very poor knowledge of how the works that women and men perform are paid, rather we have heard saying that they pay all equally on a day rate, but then adding that the payment derives from the qualification and difficulty of the task.

¹⁶ Teimuraz Glonti, Chef editor of the magazine "Vazi da Gvino"; Levan Bregvadze, literature criticist.

- Although, most of respondents tend to stress on equal treatment and equal opportunities for men and women in their companies and that differences in positions and payment are due to difference in qualification, lack of will and influence of traditional division of the “hard” and “soft” works. (for details see expert interview analysis)
- There is no understanding of barriers existing for women to occupy positions or to perform tasks that are considered as “men’s” tasks.
- And finally, there is no any action plan elaborated to overcome barriers (as they are not identified and recognized) and to provide women the same opportunities for education, training, in recruitment, and in obtaining positions and jobs they are interested in or, the decision making positions.

Women’s Empowerment Framework criteria, such as: wellbeing, access to recourses, awareness/education, participation and control - were elaborated through following topics of the questionnaire-guide for the interview:

- Ratio – total, on the positions, per specialties
- Participation in decision making
- Barriers, glass ceiling effect
- Welfare - equal payment, access to ownership
- Sources of empowerment
- Opportunities for development – education, training, rules of recruitment to certain positions
- Consideration of the special needs of women- family, time, physical restrictions

In this gender analysis trends and attitudes were traced as well.

Analyzing Gender equality by topics

Following topics were identified during analysis as mostly relevant and informative for gender equality/inequality issue.

Women/Men ratio and division of specialities

In the wine companies - Most of our respondents estimated the men/women permanent staff ratio in their enterprises as approximately 20-30% of women to 70-r 80% of men. Different was the picture with part time employers (workers) during the field works. Here the number of women contractors can make even 70% of total.

Decision making positions – None of respondents knew personally any women taking up the leading post, like president or general director in the wine companies. Though, we have majority of women in a middle level staff - office managers, financial managers in administration staff and heads of quality control laboratories.

Division of specialities - We observe quite a strict division of specialties within wine enterprises, although there are no recorded regulations or rules, but rather traditional set of roles. Thus, profession of “winemaker” meaning technologist is totally occupied by men. While laboratories with its heads are women dominated sphere. The main part of office work is given to women as well.

In the factory - there are no women in the winemaking process. ‘Marani’ works are traditionally men’s occupation. It is explained as a physically hard, stressful and unlimited in time, which naturally closes door to women. Although in bottling department (‘chamosasxmeli cexi’) and on the works that are connected with the external face of the production enterprises prefer to have women. The works concerning with washing and preparing the cistern are the case of typical

manly task: "Women can not climb up the cistern" or " While warking in France I even climbed up the cistern. The same is with the works connected with mechanisms and machinery. "It is a matter of brain organization" (Z.R.), and women can not perform them. And finally, cleaning, which is completely female prescribed and practiced work.

In the field work - there are works prescribed to and thus naturally performed by men, like preparation of the soil, digging, trimming and chemical treatment to bed plants/seedlings. So call "green operations" are performed by women. The principle of the division, as reported by respondents, seems to be based on traditional understanding of "hard" and "soft" works. "Green operations need care and accuracy", while digging or trimming need physical power. To our observation, after "digging deeper" to the issue the division was based rather on qualified and less-qualified works, which usually has its financial implication. For example, highly qualified agronomists are only men. And finally, it seems that men's tasks are more valued and perceived as more important in overall process.

Vintage. Men and women are equally involved in vintage process. In theory, women only pick the grapes and men carry the heavy baskets to the vehicles; but in reality women do also carry on the heavy works.

Marketing. According to the data we have obtained during the research, women involvement in wine marketing sector is high. Thus, specialists in marketing in the factories were mostly women,

Estimation of competence

Through interviews competence seems to be a highly relevant concept for the winemaking process. Generally there is a lack of qualified personnel, especially winemakers and good winegrower. According to expert's the "market offers much more qualified men than women and during recruitment priority is naturally given to men". As receiving proper qualification happens through education and especially practice and women are nearly excluded from practicing winemaking – it is considered hard and requires 24 our involvement, women receives poor/no qualification. Although there are several theorists women in wine technology, having degrees in the field but nowadays they stay away from practicing.

We have heard respondents saying "Men are better in this sphere". Although there is a need for good winemaker, boys have better chances .

Barriers

One of the issues here is an estimation of competence of men and women. Generally respondents reported the lack of qualified personnel, especially winemakers and good winegrower". According to expert's the "market offers much more qualified men than women and during recruitment priority is naturally given to men". As receiving proper qualification happens through education and especially practice and women are nearly excluded from practicing winemaking – it is considered "hard and requires 24 our involvement", women receives poor/no qualification. Although there are several women specialized in wine technology, having academic degrees in the field but nowadays they stay away from practicing.

We have heard respondents saying "Men are better in this sphere" or "Although there is a need for good winemaker, boys have better chances".

According to respondents several distinguished reasons as sources to restrict women from winemaker's profession can be identified:

Tradition – "It is men's job and always was"

Women's perceived inability to perform certain tasks – serious, stressful, hard, requiring physical and psychological strength etc;

Families - requiring wives, mothers and daughters to stay home and not letting them to work during the night times and away from their homes;
Discrimination during recruitment;
Discouragement of women during education;
Lack of will and appropriate knowledge about this profession from women's side – “If I only knew how interesting it is when I was young, I would choose winemaking “

Education and training - opportunities for development

According to respondents emphasize family is the first place where young receives information and gets motivated to follow a winemaker's path. It is especially the case of girls, as we have not heard of any women involved in wine business without having family traditions in this sphere. Thus two of our respondent's mothers were heads of laboratories (actually winemakers) in the wine factories.

Educational institutions for the future winemakers are: Agrarian universities in Tbilisi and Telavi University and some private institutes. Both institutions today offer bachelor and masters degree in winemaking. The men/women ratio of participation in master's program makes 10 to 3 (information derived from interviews with the professors”. To other respondents estimation there are no more than 2-3% of girls in overall education process. According to one lecturers knowledge this year no girl from the food technology department choose winemaking as a speciality. Traditional stereotypes about the jobs inappropriate for women, opinion about the winemaking as too hard for women, problems that families create for girls aiming to go abroad to gain the qualification, according to our respondents explain why women do not go to study winemaking at the university.

Experts note that training takes place through “international programs”. One respondents mentioned internal training (qualification courses) where both “men and women participate equally”. Several times wine testing courses were mentioned; where usually 1 woman to 10 men is a picture. GTZ training programs generally seem to be the most promoting for women. Andreas Rook (spelling could be different) a GTZ expert made really encouraging statement about women's special talents in testing, which opened door to women in this field. (Today one third of National Testing Commission members are women). On the contrary, Mr. Shalva Khcuriani, the winemaker, from the words of our one respondent, declares that “testing should be a man's task”.

Equal Payment

The respondents think that men and women are equally remunerated in wine sector. Although, almost all of them recognized that people are paid according to their qualification, and skilled men are much more than skilled women, accordingly men are on well paid positions and earn more than women. These tendencies are better observed in field work. They even say that women ask less for the work they perform. And “*in this case nobody is going to pay more than you ask for.*” This indicates low self-esteem and “low perceived qualification” of women. In one of the interviews the respondent spoke about the women as “zero-qualified “staff. These are the women who work for decades on list respected and badly remunerated positions - as cleaners.

Of course, the gender misbalance in total income in the sphere is due to the tendency that all the high management positions are occupied by men.

Inheritance

Dominant position of men in wine sector is due to the tradition when the family vineyards are inherited by men in the family. Women can inherit only if there is no sun in the family. That is

why there are very few women who own the vineyards. Although, one of the respondents commented that purchasing the vineyards is becoming more attractive lately.

Conclusions

- In wine making business there is still a clear gender segregation of the specialities. This is mostly based on stereotypical understanding of “man’s” or “women’s” tasks and which is connected to the concepts of qualification, high ranked jobs and remunerations of labor.
- There is no gender sensitive approach observed in any of surveyed objects. There is no awareness about difference that men’s and women’s jobs create in terms of power, influence and income. Gender needs (especially strategic) are not questioned. It is perceived that there are no constraint forces for women to participate in any activities or to occupy any posts within the wine enterprise.
- The wine production quality control is a sphere within wine production chain where women can gain qualification, exercise influence and control.
- There is an impression that in the middle and high level of wine-production management the share of involved women has increased mostly due to the need for new specialities: managers, marketing and PR specialists that contemporary educational system is providing.
- Girls are inclined to follow winemaker’s path only if there is a family tradition of mother or father working in the wine factory.
- The modernized wine enterprises that are in partnership with GTZ being oriented towards the market requirements, make more accent on the competence/qualification of the employees rather than ‘tradition’; This gives women more chance to enter the sphere and develop their career, but on the other hand as there is a lack of girls/ women during education and training, changes are not yet visible.
- The number of girls entering winemaking speciality is drawing to zero mark. Generally, there is a very poor encouragement for women to enter the winemaking speciality as it is perceived men’s profession. One of the factors is a family, with it’s restrictive role.
- Training programs and study tours offered by GTZ give opportunities to more women to enter the sphere and approach high positions.
- There is quite poor knowledge (also from other women’s side) about women’s problems : inheritance practice, ownership, successful women in the field, educational issues, etc.

Gender dimension in GTZ activities in wine sector

Achievement of gender equality is a precondition for sustainable development and a matter of human rights. GTZ recognises existence of gender specific disadvantages and requires to look systematically at the issue and put it into practice effectively. There are several guidelines for practical technical cooperation for achieving gender equality: cross - sectoral and cross stage approach; Interventions at micro, mezzo and macro levels; Consideration of practical and strategic gender needs; Focus on men – women relation, rather than on women solely; And participation of stakeholders.

According to the new gender equality classification system by DAC there are three levels of gender equality approaches for the project. G2 marker means that gender equality is a primary goal of the project and is expressed in the project purpose and in the hierarchy of objectives; G1 marker means that Gender is an important, but not crucial for implementation, but it is clearly anchored in the projects concepts; G0 – means, the project is not geared to gender equality. Additional dimension of the project could be classification on Action needed – “no” and Action needed – “yes”, were Action Needed ‘No’ means that women and men participate in planning and benefits of the project, or that no gender specific impacts are expected; in Action Needed “yes” projects - additional information is needed or more measures must be planned in order to ensure the participation of both men and women.

Considering GTZ project: *Promoting Private Sector in Georgia* from gender perspective we should note that although gender equality was not the primary goal of the projects and thus does not belong to G2 category, analysis of the activities under the project shows out some achievements and demonstrate intention of the development agency to consider gender at various levels and influence gender role related changes. Through various activities we could trace following levels of gender related involvement in: *intention, action or results*

Educational activities:

Training programs.

Almost all our respondents emphasise the exceptional role of trainings organised and initiated by GTZ concerning : Legal Services, Quality of wine, Testing samples, Cross marketing, Quality management and Organizational management, Wine tourism. Although, the participation of women in these events was not high, but taking into consideration small number of women in this sector, we assume that there was certain set to make women participate and there always were 10-30% of women. Our respondents say, that they send women from their enterprises to these trainings eagerly.

Study tours –During the selection for the study tours we can observe some intention to promote women. So, in every so called eye opener tours to Portugal, Italy, and Austria there were at least two women representing either state, or private institutions in wine (agriculture) sector. This is a list of women participants:

Begiashvili Lili, Khitarishvili Anna, Manjgaladze Irma, Mgeladze Nestan, Gigauri Ketevan

Some examples of Institutional support by GTZ that helped promoting women

GTZ has initiated and supported Food Products Control Laboratory which should serve every enterprise and that women are employed in this organization. According to our respondents, it is important that women from different wine companies were working together on the organization of this laboratory.

GTZ has supported laboratory in Mildiani with the equipment, which means that women became direct and indirect beneficiaries. (Working conditions, better opportunities, influence etc.)

Some respondents mentioned International Wine Exhibition, organized by GTZ, in which their women representatives actively participated.

Supporting women in approaching leading positions

GTZ has supported foundation and organizational development of Young Wine maker Union ,where the woman was nominated as a chairperson. According to one of our respondents, Ana Godableridze got the best results in the selection process (using questionnaire as well) conducted.

Ana – an empowering case

Anna is a young and powerful woman. She has achieved much in the winemaking sphere: she is a chairman of national testing (degustation) committee and the president of winemakers union –in these two initiatives she was really supported by GTZ. Currently she is working on her doctoral degree thesis.

Anna is a good practitioner winemaker and thinks that there are no differences for women or men in winemaking field: “you just have to experience everything by yourself to become real winemaker”. From the beginning of her carrier she started performing every task required from the winemaker, sobering all nights during vintage with the other staff members.

After two years of work in Burgundy and Bordeaux and doing things in every stage of vineyard work and winemaking – Anna obtained exceptional knowledge helping her to overcome stereotypical boundaries, and finally, she really started loving her profession.

She was only 29 years old heading the wine factory when her “Saperavi” wine that she made independently, received a gold medal on the competition. Her wine several times was estimated as the best and worth exporting to abroad.

During university years Anna’s fellow student girls were as successful as she, some of them even completed their doctoral studies, but their knowledge is not required in the wine business. Some of them changed their specialty.

Anna inherited her interest to winemaking from her mother, also the winemaker, head of the quality control laboratory. and further developed and diversified her professional skills. “Everything depends on professional skills” – she often says. She is sure that wine sector is open to women. Being a highest jury in wine quality Anna’s commission decides wine entrepreneurs fate and she thinks it is perceived a normal condition when woman is a decision maker in the field.

To Anna’s knowledge, not few women are owing their household vineyards; in few years she herself is planning to buy her own large vineyards.

Considering all above mentioned, and understanding that there could be much more, then one can take out through interviews and documents, the project *Promoting Private Sector in Georgia, wine sector-* could be considered as G1 marker project, but we would suggest to add some directly gender oriented action, (that means *Action Needed estimation*) based on some recommendations given below.

Recommendations

The following recommendations can be addressed to GTZ project for promotion of Private Sector Development - Wine Sector, together with the stakeholders: wine enterprises, educational institutions and the state institutions. Implementation of the recommendations oriented towards gender equality requires certain commitment as well as good will for doing so. That is why elaboration of gender policy for the initial stage is advisable.

Most of the recommendations are specific in nature and are based on the problems concerning gender equity, that exist in the wine sector and that are derived from the study. They could build the foundation for further gender sensitive approaches and help to elaborate guidelines oriented towards gender equality in the wine sector in general.

1. To develop gender sensitive approaches in the wine business and wine enterprises in particular: (GTZ, wine enterprises)

- a) On the initial stage equipping the wine enterprises management the gender equality check-lists; Elaboration of Gender Policy documents for/by wine companies, where commitment for gender equality is emphasized;
- b) Conducting Gender dis-aggregated statistics;

2. To overcome gender stereotypical approaches on educational level: (GTZ, educational institutions)

- a) Encouragement of women on educational level – promotional materials, reflecting and creating of positive cases, using foreign experience, education free from stereotypical division of specialities, gender awareness training for professors and students;

3. To Empower women winemakers: (GTZ, wine enterprises)

- a) Establishing of experience exchange tours within and outside Georgia with active participation of women of different positions (e.g. “women to women” experience exchange program);
- b) Increasing cooperation with women’s NGOs, with elaboration of special women’s empowering program;

4. To create positive images : (within project activities)

- a) Creating/reflecting images of women: in the activities connected with wine production; On the leading and decision making positions; During performing “non-traditional” tasks (e.g. women working with technical equipment etc.).

5. To set proper political approach in Wine Sector Development (GTZ, State)

and finally, to guarantee the political support on the state level for gender equality it would be strongly recommended to participate or initiate in :

- a) Elaboration of Georgian Wine Industry State Policy with clear **gender dimension** and non-discriminative approach;
- b) Elaboration of Georgian Wine Industry State Action Plan with concrete **gender mainstreaming** tools in the field;

Informational sources:

Feride Zurikashvili – Gender and Socio-Economic Development, in “Gender, Culture and Modernity”, Tbilisi, 2005

Lesley Abdela, - Sevolution, Gender Equity and Awareness, Training Module, 2001.

SEAGA - Socio-Economic and Gender Analysis Programme. FAO,2001.

Gender and Project Management, A contribution to the quality management of GTZ. Juliane Osterhaus,

GTZ documentation referring to the Project “Development of Private Sector in Georgia”